

Chautauqua County Abbreviated Consolidated Plan Lead-based Paint Hazard Control Strategy Final

January, 2013

Introduction

Chautauqua County Department of Planning & Economic Development is preparing this "Abbreviated Consolidated Plan for Lead-based Paint Hazard Control Strategy" in accordance with HUD 24 CFR 91.235.

Chautauqua County is a large and mainly rural county which makes up the westernmost tip of New York State. It is 1,062 square miles of primarily rural countryside, and is bounded on the north by Lake Erie; on the west by Erie County, PA; on the south by Warren County, PA; on the northeast by Erie County, NY; and on the east by Cattaraugus County, NY. The County's population, based on the 2010 Census, was 134,905. The density, excluding persons in group quarters, amounts to 127 persons per square mile. The largest city in Chautauqua County is Jamestown, which has a population of 31,146 (2010 Census).

The Control of Lead-based Paint Hazards in the County Housing Stock is the sole emphasis of the strategy provide in this abbreviated consolidated plan. This will be accomplished by providing:

- I. Needs Assessment;
- II. Inventorying the Available Resources; and
- III. Identifying Planned Activities.

I. Needs Assessment

This section will estimate the number of housing units that contain lead-based paint hazards (as defined in section 1004 of the Residential Lead-Based Paint Hazard Reduction Act of 1992), and are occupied by extremely low-income, low-income, and moderate-income families. A description of actions that will occur to evaluate and reduce the number of housing units containing lead-based paint hazards, a discussion of how the strategies for reducing lead-based hazards are related to the extent of lead poisoning and hazards, and a description of how lead based paint hazard reduction will be integrated into housing policies and programs will be provided in Section III - Planned Activities.

Estimated Number of Housing Units Containing Lead-based Paint

Age and condition of housing. Until 2003, Chautauqua County comprised the Jamestown-Dunkirk Metropolitan Statistical Area (MSA). Today, Chautauqua County has been designated as the Jamestown-Dunkirk-Fredonia Metropolitan Statistical Area. The 2010 Census revealed that 46.6% of the housing in the county was built before 1940, which we can assume from the 2000 Census data, is the highest percentage of any MSA in the country (*See Table 1 – Age of Housing*). *Note: This information is not yet available from the 2010 Census as of the date of this report.*

Table 1. Age of housing

GCT-H7: Housing Units: 2000

Data Set: Census 2000 Summary File 3 (SF 3) - Sample Data		Percent		
		Year Structure Built		
Geographic Area: United States and Puerto Rico - - Metropolitan Area		Total housing units	1990 to March 2000	1939 or earlier
United States		115,904,641	17.0	15.0
In metropolitan area		90,812,914	16.6	14.3
1	Jamestown, NY MSA (Chautauqua County)	64,900	7.0	47.3
2	Scranton--Wilkes-Barre--Hazleton, PA MSA	280,494	8.0	43.9
3	Pittsfield, MA MSA	40,429	4.7	41.0
4	Altoona, PA MSA	55,061	9.3	39.9
5	Jersey City, NJ PMSA	240,618	6.3	39.4
6	New Bedford, MA PMSA	74,223	7.3	39.2
7	Boston, MA--NH PMSA	1,377,707	7.0	38.6
8	Utica—Rome, NY MSA	134,829	8.1	38.2
9	Fitchburg--Leominster, MA PMSA	57,649	8.6	37.9
10	Elmira, NY MSA	37,745	5.7	37.9
11	Johnstown, PA MSA	102,959	7.4	37.3
12	Williamsport, PA MSA	52,464	10.6	36.0
13	Wheeling, WV--OH MSA	69,216	7.8	35.9
14	Lewiston--Auburn, ME MSA	40,455	10.2	35.3
15	New York, NY PMSA	3,680,360	4.5	34.7
16	Duluth--Superior, MN--WI MSA	116,156	9.2	34.6
17	Boston--Worcester--Lawrence, MA--NH--ME--CT	2,318,421	8.8	34.4
18	Cumberland, MD--WV MSA	45,078	8.6	33.7
19	Sheboygan, WI MSA	45,947	14.5	33.7
20	Terre Haute, IN MSA	63,705	12.2	33.2
21	Albany--Schenectady--Troy, NY MSA	386,262	11.1	32.9
22	Binghamton, NY MSA	110,227	6.7	32.7
23	Reading, PA MSA	150,222	13.7	32.6
24	Dubuque, IA MSA	35,505	12.0	32.4
25	Sioux City, IA--NE MSA	48,922	11.2	32.4

Of all the Metropolitan Statistical Areas in the United States in 2000, Chautauqua County had the highest percentage of pre-1940 housing (47.3%). The 25 oldest are listed above.

In 1973, a county-wide reassessment by Cole Layer & Trumble found that approximately 1/3 of the county's housing stock to be substandard. Work to repair and improve housing over the past 39 years is not only countered by the ongoing effect of weather and age, but also by the health risks posed by the impact of lead and asbestos hazards, which have only become known as issues more recently.

Calculation from current reassessments gathered by the county GIS program yields over 70% of housing units in need of work—over 37,000 units, based on two factors: (1) the 76% of housing units built before 1960, which are extremely likely to have lead paint hazards as well as asbestos

and (2) the 13.4% of county housing units found to be in fair (with “signs of excess deterioration for its age”) or poor condition (“obvious signs of excess deterioration”) in the current reassessments. The 71% overall, 37,237 units, is the sum of 30,171 units with hazards due to age (76% of the 39,870 “normal” units) and the 7,066 fair and poor, divided by 52,587 units which have been reassessed.

Given that 39 years have passed since 1973 and that the lead and asbestos hazards are only recently identified, the increase in units needing work is to be expected, in spite of thousands of units that have been improved through the efforts of private owners and public and not-for-profit housing rehabilitation programs.

Family and Household Income. As we consider the age of housing, we must also look at the income of the County's residents, which dictates a household's ability to maintain or repair their homes. We can infer from the 2000 Census that the County's median family income in 2010, was amongst the lowest of any of the NYS MSAs, at \$51,031, as was the median household income at \$40,639. Overall poverty statistics are similar, at 17.1% Chautauqua County's rate is the highest of any MSA in the state outside the city of New York. Children under 18 years old at 25.7% in poverty exceeded all but NYC, and the elderly and family poverty rates also exceeded all but the greater NYC metropolitan area (*See Table 2 - Income and Poverty*). *Note: This information is not yet available from the 2010 Census as of the date of this report.*

Table 2. Income & Poverty NYS Metros and Erie Metro

GCT-P14: Income and Poverty in 1999: 2000

Data Set: Census 2000 Summary File 3 (SF 3) - Sample Data

Geographic Area: NYS Metropolitan Areas with addition of nearby Erie PA Metro Area

Ranked by Household Median Income

Geographic area	Median income in 1999 (dollars)		Per capita income in 1999 (dollars)	Median earnings in 1999 of full-time, year-round workers (dollars)		Income in 1999 below poverty level			% of families
	Households	Families		Male	Female	Percent of population for whom poverty status is determined			
						All ages	Related children under 18 years	65 years and over	
United States	41,994	50,046	21,587	37,057	27,194	12.4	16.1	9.9	9.2
In metropolitan areas MSAs	44,755	52,754	22,729	39,032	28,816	11.8	15.5	9.1	8.7
Jamestown, NY	33,458	41,054	16,840	32,114	22,214	13.8	19.3	8.2	9.7
Utica--Rome, NY	35,292	44,174	18,006	31,616	23,491	12.9	18.2	9.0	9.6

Binghamton, NY	36,374	45,698	19,067	33,790	24,335	11.9	14.5	6.7	8.2
Elmira, NY	36,415	43,994	18,264	35,076	24,215	13.0	18.4	6.8	9.1
Erie, PA	36,627	44,829	17,932	35,465	23,886	12.0	15.7	7.7	8.2
Buffalo--Niagara Falls, NY	38,488	49,146	20,143	38,468	26,173	11.9	16.8	7.7	9.0
Glens Falls, NY	38,526	45,159	19,368	32,070	22,229	9.6	13.2	6.6	7.0
Syracuse, NY	39,750	49,270	20,002	36,842	26,186	12.1	15.2	7.7	8.5
Albany--Schenectady—Troy	43,250	54,304	22,303	38,467	28,621	9.4	11.9	7.0	6.5
Rochester, NY	43,955	53,609	21,627	39,610	27,761	10.3	13.8	7.3	7.4
New York--Northern NJ-- Long Island, NY--NJ--CT-- PA	50,795	60,254	26,604	45,115	34,464	12.9	17.2	10.9	10.2
New York, NY	41,053	46,471	24,076	40,072	34,176	19.5	27.2	16.2	16.6
Newburgh, NY—PA	51,151	58,416	21,444	42,017	30,463	10.1	14.1	7.6	7.2
Nassau--Suffolk, NY	68,351	76,430	29,278	51,109	35,658	5.6	6.3	5.9	3.7

Jamestown had the lowest income for either households or families of any of the NYS metros in 2000, and had amongst the highest percentage of poverty in NYS in all categories.

II. Inventory of Available Resources

To help meet these needs in Chautauqua County, a network of not-for-profit Housing and Community Development Service providers works with government agencies and the private sector, utilizing federal, state and private funding sources. The following list begins with the four Preservation Companies, funded in part by the NYS Division of Housing and Community Renewal, then the City Departments of Development, and agencies focused on special housing and human service needs.

1. COI - Chautauqua Opportunities Inc. – county-wide programs including HEAP energy assistance, Emergency Services, Weatherization, Section 8 vouchers, Fredonia Commons, etc., a Community Action Agency.
2. CHRIC – Chautauqua Home Rehabilitation and Improvement Corporation – county-wide programs including grants and loans for home repairs, adaptations for elderly, making homes lead-safe, auto loans for employment, first-time homebuyers, etc.
3. CODE – Citizens Opportunity for Development & Equality – housing and economic development programs in Jamestown, subsidized rental units, etc.
4. JURA – Jamestown Urban Renewal Agency/Department of Development – housing code enforcement, housing rehab, homeownership, emergency repair programs, etc.
5. City of Dunkirk Department of Development/Local Development Corporation – CDBG Administration, housing rehabilitation program, small business development.
6. STEL – Southern Tier Environments for Living – community residences and supportive housing in Jamestown and Dunkirk for persons with mental illness
7. SILC – Southwestern Independent Living Center – assistance for disabled persons in locating accessible housing and general support
8. Salvation Army Agnes Home Women’s Shelter – domestic violence center for women and children, with support staff
9. CCRM – Chautauqua County Rural Ministry – temporary or emergency permanent housing for displaced families and individuals

10. TRC – The Resource Center – residential services for developmentally disabled individuals
11. County Office for the Aging – provides funding for wheelchair ramps and other home accessibility measures for the elderly
12. Lakeshore Long Term Home Health Care – funding for accessibility for disabled persons

III. Planned Activities

This section will provide a description of activities to be undertaken to evaluate and/or reduce the number of housing units containing lead-based paint hazards. These activities directly correlate to Needs Assessment provided in Section I, by provide a brief discussion of how the strategies for reducing lead-based hazards are related to the extent of lead poisoning and hazards, and a will discuss how lead based paint hazard reduction will be integrated into housing policies and programs.

Activity #1: Rehabilitate Substandard Owner-occupied Housing.

As described in Section I – Needs Assessment, an estimated 37,000 homes in Chautauqua County are in need of work. That being said, a primary goal of this activity is to rehabilitate 240-300 units per year, or 1200-1500 over five years. Depending on the size of the program and funds available each year, each of the county’s six rehab entities, COI, CHRIC, Jamestown Department of Development, Dunkirk Department of Development, and the Office for the Aging, repairs between 10 and 120 units per year, averaging approximately 40 to 50 units overall per year (when funds are available). The goal, with a rough GIS-based estimate of 37,000 units overall in need of work, both owner and rental types, is to increase this output by urging the entities to develop policies aimed at reducing lead-based paint hazards in the County.

The primary resources that will be brought to bear on this issue will include a variety of sources, from a variety of locally sponsored housing rehab and improvement programs, such as the NYS HOME program, the Affordable Housing Program, the Affordable Housing Corporation, Weatherization program, Restore NY, Jamestown and Dunkirk CDBG programs, the Office for the Aging and other housing improvement programs.

Activity #2: Rehabilitate Substandard Rental Units; Reduce Lead-Based Paint Hazards

As described in Section I – Needs Assessment, approximately 75% of housing units in the county were built before 1960. This being the case, a primary goal of this activity is to rehabilitate 140 units per year, or 700 over five years. The goal is to increase this output by urging the entities to develop policies aimed at reducing lead-based paint hazards in the County.

The primary resources that will be brought to bear on this issue will include CDBG/GOSC funds, Restore NY funds, NYS HOME Funds, HUD Lead Hazard Control funds through the Chautauqua County Health Department, and a modest cost share of 20% matching funds from landlords, with average projects of \$12,600 per unit, a five-year total goal of \$8,820,000. The average landlord share of \$2,520 per unit secures \$10,080 in additional funds for the work. Units are made more attractive to stable tenants as doors and windows are updated and made energy-efficient and the unit receives designation as lead-safe.

Activity #3: Demolish unsalvageable housing and other structures

As described in Section I – Needs Assessment, approximately 75% of housing units in the county were built before 1960; however, it is unclear how many of these units need to be demolished. The county’s 1973 reappraisal defined 1,229 units as “beyond repair.” The most recent assessment using the County’s GIS showed 852 structures in “poor” condition having “obvious signs of excess deterioration.” A best-case scenario would estimate that perhaps 700 of these units could be restored to usefulness, but this would require extensive private sector investment. We estimate that at least a quarter of these structures blight whole neighborhoods, bringing down property values in a broad area. In mid-2012, Chautauqua County was approved as one of New York State's first Land Banks because Empire State Development (ESD), the administrator of the program, clearly recognized that the County's housing stock is deplorable. This being the case, a primary goal of this activity is to demolish a minimum of 25 buildings per year; 125 over five years. The goal is to increase this output by urging the entities to develop policies aimed at demolishing dilapidated structures throughout the County.

The primary resources that will be brought to bear on this issue will include CDBG/HOME/Restore NY funding at \$20,000 per unit to include asbestos testing and removal; \$500,000 per year, for a five year total of \$2,500,000. The Chautauqua County Land Bank intends to work with these agencies to accomplish these goals.

Activity #4: Make Chautauqua a Lead-Safe County for children

As described in Section I – Needs Assessment, approximately 75% of housing units in the county were built before 1960; however, it is not entirely clear how many of these units contain lead. According to the 2000 Census, 47% (30,686 units) of the County’s existing housing stock is pre-1940, and 86% of the units were built before 1980. In the most recently completed Lead Hazard grant, almost 90% of the over 800 units that were tested for Lead Based Paint hazards showed dust lead levels above Environmental Protection Agency guidelines. Applying that percentage to county units built before 1940 reveals that over 27,000 housing units in the county probably have hazardous levels of lead. Applying it to housing units built prior to 1980 yields even more units. Lead in dust and peeling paint is accessible to toddlers, and developing nervous systems are at risk of permanent damage from lead poisoning.

This being the case, a primary goal of this activity is to make ALL rehabbed units listed above lead-safe, approximately 2,225 owner-occupied and rental units (from Activities #1 & #2). This initiative will also seek to educate rehabilitation contractors who work in the county and their workers in Lead-safe Work Practices. It will also seek to educate parents and childcare providers in reducing lead hazards in the home and in childcare settings. The county has been awarded several national Lead Hazard Control grants from HUD because of the seriousness of the lead hazards in the county and the effectiveness of the county program. The goal is to increase this output by urging the entities to develop policies aimed at making Chautauqua County safer for our children.

The primary resources that will be brought to bear on this issue will include all units assisted with federal funds, will require use of Lead-safe work practices, the County Health Department 2006 Lead Hazard Control grant, “Lead-Safe County III,” and will include funding for countywide education and outreach efforts.